

Technical Report on the First Stakeholder Meeting January 2014/Odessa/Ukraine

Project: Integrated hotspots management and saving
the living Black Sea ecosystem
HOT BLACK SEA
2.2.1.72761.225 MIS-ETC 2303



Document Control Sheet

| | | |
|--|--|---|
| EC Programme | Joint Operational Programme "Black Sea Basin 2007-2013" ¹ | |
| Project Full Title: | Integrated hotspots management and saving the living Black Sea ecosystem | |
| Project Acronym: | Hot Black Sea | |
| Grant Agreement No. | 2.2.1.72761.225 MIS-ETC 2303 | |
| Coordinator: | Dr. Georgeta Alecu | |
| Project start date and duration: | March 2013, 24 months | |
| Project website: | http://www.bs-hotspots.eu/ | |
| Package of Activities No: | PA 4 | |
| Package of Activities Title: | Increasing sector expertise | |
| Report Title: | Technical Report on the First Stakeholder Meeting | |
| Report Authors | Nataliia Iakovleva, Kateryna Utkina, Viktor Komorin, Tatyana Chernaya | |
| Responsible Partner Organization: | Partner 4 – Odessa State Environmental University | |
| Partners involved: | All project partners | |
| Status: | <input type="checkbox"/> | Final (F) |
| | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | Draft (D) |
| | <input type="checkbox"/> | Revised draft (RV) |
| Dissemination level: | <input type="checkbox"/> | Public (PU) |
| | <input type="checkbox"/> | Restricted to other program participants (PP) |
| | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | Restricted to a group specified by the consortium (RE) |
| | <input type="checkbox"/> | Confidential, only for members of the consortium (CO) |

¹ The Programme is managed by the Romanian Ministry of Regional Development and Tourism.

Disclaimer

The information contained in this report is subject to change without notice and should not be interpreted as a final commitment by any members of the HotBlackSea Consortium or the authors.

This document cannot be copied, reproduced or distributed, entirely or partly, without written permission from the HotBlackSea Consortium. Acknowledgement of the authors of the document shall be clearly referenced.

All rights reserved to the HotBlackSea Consortium.

ABBREVIATIONS

| | |
|----------------|---|
| FC | Foundation Caucasus Environment |
| HS | Hot Spot |
| ICPE-CA | National Institute for R&D in Electrical Engineering |
| JOP | Joint Operational Programme |
| LBS | Land Based Sources (of pollution) |
| OSENU | Odessa State Environmental University |
| SuRDEP | NGO for Sustainable Regional Development and Environment Protection |
| TUBITAK | Marmara Research Centre |
| WW | Waste water |
| WWTP | Waste water treatment plant |

INTRODUCTION

This Report has been prepared under the GA4 Increasing sector expertise of the Hot Black Sea Project “**Integrated hotspots management and saving the living Black Sea ecosystem**” ([www. http://www.bs-hotspots.eu/](http://www.bs-hotspots.eu/)), Grant Agreement No 2.2.1.72761.225 MIS-ETC 2303. The Project is financed by EC as an activity under the Joint Operational Programme “Black Sea Basin 2007-2013”². HotBlackSea is an integral part of the overall ongoing process of harmonization of policies in the Black Sea region in the field of environment protection, taking into consideration relevant European acquis.

One of the specific objectives of the project is to increase public awareness and encourage stakeholders participation in the decision-making process related to hot spots management in the project partner countries (Bulgaria, Georgia, Romania, Turkey and Ukraine). Besides, the project methodology foresees development of project ownership, visibility of the EC support and wide involvement of stakeholders in the project implementation (e.g. through Questionnaires, consultations, meetings and problem-oriented workshops). The basis of stakeholders involvement in the project was built through organization of project inception meetings in each partner country and Stakeholder Meetings.

According to the WorkPlan of the Project, the First Stakeholder Meeting should have been carried out during the period Month 1 – Month 5, but the original Ukrainian partner (Oceanological Center) cancelled their participation in the project implementation and it was replaced by the Odessa State Environmental University. That is why the project started late in Ukraine - in the middle of November and the dates of the First Stakeholder Meeting were shifted to January 28-29, 2014. Taking into account the delay with the start date of the project in Ukraine, it was decided to carry out National Inception Meeting (January 27, 2014) back-to-back with the First Stakeholder Meeting.

² The Programme is managed by the Romanian Ministry of Regional Development and Tourism.

GENERAL INFORMATION

The **First Stakeholder Meeting** took place on **January 28-29, 2014** in **Odessa**. Odessa State Environmental University was the organiser. The aims of the meeting were as follows:

- to present to stakeholders the project Consortium;
- to present preliminary results of the response to the Project Questionnaire (it was developed for receiving information from stakeholders, necessary for the major reports of the project);
- to present the project Dissemination plan and web-site;
- to present and discuss drafts of the major project reports (LBS Management Report, LBS Monitoring Report, Concept Data Base);
- to initiate dialogue with stakeholders in order to receive their recommendations on the Hot Spots Methodology, Data Base and other project activities so that to advance the project implementation in a way taking into consideration the needs of the stakeholders.

For assessment of the meeting input and for receiving information from stakeholders, Feed-Back Form was developed and distributed during the meeting.

List of participants was developed, **the total number of participants was 27**. Invitations were sent to more than 30 stakeholders. Because of extremely bad weather conditions some stakeholders, as well as project coordinator (ICPE-CA, Romania) and partners from Bulgaria (Burgas Municipality and SuRDEP), could not participate. Dr Manana Devidze (FCE, Georgia) and Pembe Ozer Erdogan (TUBITAK, Turkey) took part in the meeting. The coordinator and the missing project partners sent their presentations, which were delivered and discussed with stakeholders.

Ukrainian stakeholders were from Odessa, Nikolaev, Feodosia, Sevastopol and Kharkiv. Most of the stakeholders were from research institutes, also participants represented local environmental authorities, universities and NGOs.

/For Agenda, Feed-back Form, list of participants, presentations see: <http://www.bs-hotspots.eu/EventsGallery/>

DAY 1 – JANUARY 28, 2014

Venue: *Vele Rossa Hotel, Garshina Street, 3 12 Large Fountain Station, Odessa City*

Dr. Viktor Komorin (OSENUE Team Leader) was the moderator of the meeting.

Dr. Yuriy Tuchkovenko (OSENUE Vice-Rector on Science) made a welcome speech and presented information about the university and international projects implemented by OSENUE.

Presentations on project partners (their organizations) were made.

Each stakeholder presented himself/herself and their organizations. The following stakeholders made presentations related to the objectives of the HotBlackSea Project:

- Prof. Tatyana Galushkina (Institute of Market Problems and Economic&Ecological Research under National Academy of Sciences of Ukraine) – Transboundary environmental management as a basis for solving the problem of "hotspots" in the Black Sea region;
- MSc Mikhail Esin (Feodosyyskaya Regional Organization "Ecology and World") – Projects in the coastal zone of the Black Sea – dangerous hot spots;
- Dr Vladimir Maltzev (Karadag Natural Reserve of the National Academy of Sciences of Ukraine) - Karadag Natural Reserve.

Dr. Manana Devidze (FCE, Georgia) presented the project Dissemination plan and web-site. This dissemination plan presents a strategy for the HOT BLACK SEA project on dissemination project results, communication and coordination with partners and stakeholders, as well as for the increase in public awareness on Black Sea hot spot monitoring and related environmental problems. The Project web-site (<http://www.bs-hotspots.eu>) was developed according to the special guideline of the JOP. SuRDEP is responsible for creation, development and sustaining of the web page. At the same time all partners were involved in its design and nourishing.

After lunch, a presentation with summary of the National Inception Meeting (January 27, 2014) was made by Dr Nataliia Iakovleva (OSENUE, Ukraine). Also the response to the Project Questionnaire was presented to the stakeholders (developed by Eugeny Godin and Dr.Kateryna Utkina, OSENUE, Ukraine). As to the date of the meeting six filled in Questionnaires were received; this information was used for compilation of the project reports and drafting conclusions/recommendations. The Stakeholders were asked to fill in the Project Questionnaire and return it to OSENUE.

Presentation on the draft LBS Management report (prepared by Dr. Georgeta Alecu, ICPE-CA, Romania) was made. Stakeholders were informed about the aim of the report, its structure, achievements, gaps/bottlenecks and suggestions/recommendations.

Pembe Ozer Erdogan (TUBITAK, Turkey) presented draft LBS Monitoring report: aim, structure, gaps and preliminary conclusions.

Discussion was initiated on the following questions:

- the size of the coastal zone, as an object for planning;
- procedure for permit issuing in Ukraine;
- LBS monitoring and management practice in Ukraine;
- identification of sensitive areas within coastal zone;
- possibility to use integrated coastal zone management approach, which has demonstrated good results in EU countries;
- provision and distribution of information about LBS management to general public.

All participants took part in the discussions; it allowed to identify the following gaps and disadvantages of the existing LBS/HS monitoring and management procedures in Ukraine:

- insufficient financing;
- contradictory legislation, lack of methodological and information provisions for the decision-making system on LBS;
- ineffective work of local authorities;
- lack of operability in monitoring data reporting to end-users;
- basin-wide approach for calculation of waste water (WW) discharges is not used in practice and that is why it is not possible to assess and take into account cumulative effect for pollutants;
- lack of regular and effective monitoring of the Black Sea and HS/LBS;
- the existing management mechanism permits selective responsibility of polluters and violators, and that is why it turns solely into a tool of fiscal penalty;
- national practice does not include new economic tools and criteria which are widely used and proved to be effective in market economy in developed countries;
- lack of finance for routine regular monitoring (background and crisis monitoring) leads to the loss of monitoring points;
- lack of monitoring of the impact of WW discharges. Each organization performs measurements, but there is no interaction/communication among them. The impact on biota is not investigated.

In addition to the listed above questions, surface run-off problems (melting snow and rain waters) were discussed. This problem is especially severe in Odessa. During heavy rains, rain water can not be treated in the waste water treatment plants (WWTPs), they capacity is not sufficient, and that is why rain water together with WW is discharged into the Black Sea without treatment. Such volley of rain water and WW causes great negative impact on the state of coastal marine waters and coastal ecosystems.

DAY 2 – JANUARY 29, 2014

Venue: *Odessa State Environmental University, Lvovskaja str. 15, Odessa City*

Tatyana Chernaya made a welcome speech and gave information about the activity of the Regional center for dissemination of environmental knowledge.

Presentation on existing methodologies for identification, assessment and ranking of HS/LBS was made (Dr. Kateryna Utkina and Dr. Vladimir Kresin, OSENU, Ukraine); also presentation on the developed Hot Spots Data Base Concept (developed by Dr. Violeta Velikova, SuRDEP, Bulgaria) was made. Discussion on methodological and information provisions for the decision-making system on HS/LBS was initiated. Stakeholders expressed great interest in the HS Data Base.

Dr Yuriy Tuchkovenko, Vice-Rector, organized an excursion around the Odessa State Environmental University for the participants. During this excursion the stakeholders had a possibility to see equipped rooms, laboratories, auditoriums and visit several departments (Department of IT, Department of Informatics, Department of Automated Systems for Environmental Monitoring, Department of Hydrogeology and Water Researches and Department of Agro-meteorology and Agro-meteorological Forecast).

ANALYSIS OF THE FEED-BACK FORM

Analysis of the Feed-Back Form allows making the following conclusions:

- the project “Integrated hotspots management and saving the living Black Sea ecosystem” is interesting for all stakeholders;
- the First stakeholder Meeting (January 28-29, 2014) in Odessa was carried out at high level: 90 % of stakeholders has rated their opinion as “very high” and 10 % - as “high”;
- Most stakeholders think that HS/LBS monitoring and management procedures in Ukraine are not effective (they gave various reasons, detailed information is given above);
- stakeholders, dealing with HS management, do not use any methodology for HS ranking;

- for the HS Methodology the project partners should consider point pollution sources located on the territory of administrative districts (35%) or oblasts (50 %);
- stakeholders dealing with HS/LBS management have their data bases, they have given more detailed information in the project Questionnaire. At the same time, these data are not enough for the most stakeholders to make decisions.

RECOMMENDATIONS

During the First Stakeholder Meeting discussions and in the Feed-back Form the stakeholders have given the following recommendations to the project consortium:

- to study European practices and experience on HS/LBS management and monitoring (i.e. legislation, infrastructure, types and procedures of monitoring, communication and interaction among bodies and entities, dealing with HS/LBS monitoring and management, etc.) and use them during the development of the HS Methodology and HS Data Base;
- during the development of the HS Methodology it is necessary to consider and study LBS (municipal and industrial WWTPs) located in the coastal protected area (2 km along the coast line) and those located on the territory of administrative districts or oblasts (administrative region in Ukraine);
- to develop recommendations on the size of coastal zone (as the object of planning) to introduce this term into the national legislation;
- to consider the possibility to apply mathematical modeling methods for assessment of LBS impact;
- to study the impact of the surface run-off (rain water) on the quality of the Black Sea coastal water;
- for reduction of negative anthropogenic impact on the coastal zone (marine area) it is worthwhile to use positive experience of integrated coastal zone management, this practice is widely used and gives positive results in the Europe;
- to develop recommendations on the strengthening the responsibility of polluters, at least at national level;
- to discuss existing problems on international level and to introduce positive experience on identification and personification of responsibility for pollution into Ukrainian practice.

PHOTOS



