



**Minutes of the Second training in use of the Hot Spots methodology and Hot Spots Data Base
of the project**

**Integrated hotspots management and saving the living Black Sea ecosystem – HOT BLACK SEA
2.2.1.72761.225 MIS-ETC 2303**

Date: 4 – 7 August 2015, Batumi, Georgia

Organizer:

Foundation Caucasus Environment FCE – Georgia

Participants:

Georgeta Alecu, ICPE-CA, Romania, project coordinator
Andreea Voinea, ICPE-CA, Romania
Violeta Velikova, SuRDEP, Bulgaria
Velichka Velikova, Burgas Municipality, Bulgaria
Marineta Nikolova, Burgas Municipality
Manana Devidze, Foundation Caucasus, Georgia
Gulsen Avaz, TUBITAC MRC, Turkey
Mehmet Kitis, TUBITAC MRC, Turkey
Katerina Utkina, OSENU
Volodymyr Kresin, OSENU
Natalia Iakovleva, Association "Industrial Waste Management Centre"
Meri Khalvashi, National Environmental Agency, Fisheries and the Black Sea Monitoring Centre
Eteri Mikashvidze, National Environmental Agency, Fisheries and the Black Sea Monitoring Centre
Tsiuri Gvarishvili, National Environmental Agency, Fisheries and the Black Sea Monitoring Centre
Marina Mgeladze, National Environmental Agency, Fisheries and the Black Sea Monitoring Centre
Rezo Goradze, National Environmental Agency, Fisheries and the Black Sea Monitoring Centre
Irina Baramidze, National Environmental Agency, Fisheries and the Black Sea Monitoring Centre
Dodo Jgenti, National Environmental Agency, Fisheries and the Black Sea Monitoring Centre
Nino Chkhobadze, Greens Movement of Georgia
Manana Juruli, Georgian Environmental and Biomonitoring Association
Giorgi Rukhadze, Ltd. Laboratory Research Centre, Poti
Izolda Matchutadze, NGO „Chaobi“
Manana Devidze, Foundation Caucasus Environment
Levan Tskhakaia, Foundation Caucasus Environment
Marine Piroshmanashvili, Foundation Caucasus Environment
Dimitri Tskhakaia, Foundation Caucasus Environment
Keti Memarne, Batumi State University

Minutes of the meeting:

The Training on the HS Methodology and Database took place on August 5-6, 2015 in Batumi. meeting agenda is enclosed as Annex 1. The organizer of the training was Foundation Caucasus Environment. Venue: Radison Blue Hotel Batumi, Conference hall 2. All partners of the HOT BLACK SEA project attended the training in Batumi. Stakeholders belonged to 7 organizations outside of the project consortium.

The meeting was opened at 10 AM on 5th August Wednesday by the Georgian project team leader, Dr. Manana Devidze, who welcomed the participants.

Violeta Velikova (SurDEP Team Leader) was the moderator of the workshop.

Each participant made a short presentation of himself/herself, his/her institution and key sphere of activity.

The aims of the training were as follows:

- o to present the HS Methodology, demonstrate how it works and share Ukrainian partners experience and skills in identification and prioritization of HSs with Georgian stakeholders;
- o to present the HS Database and explain how to use it online;
- o to initiate dialogue with Georgian stakeholders and collect comments/recommendations on the Hot Spots Methodology, Hot Spots Data Base and other project activities, so that to advance the project implementation taking into consideration the opinion and needs of stakeholders.

During the first day of the meeting, 4th August, the project partners arrived to Batumi and informally met to discuss the project progress and further work.

The total number of participants was 29, including 1 person by SKYPE. Representatives of all partner organizations (ICPE-CA, OSENU, TUBITAC, Burgas Municipality, SuRDEP, FCE) participated in the training. Most of the Georgian stakeholders were from Batumi Fisheries and the Black Sea Monitoring Centre, from Laboratory Research Centre Poti, also representatives of Georgian NGOs, Batumi State University and local environmental authorities of Poti attended the training.

For Agenda, List of participants, presentations, photos, media and interviews with TV companies see: <http://www.bs-hotspots.eu/EventsGallery>, <http://ajaratv.ge/ge/news/society/saertashoriso-konferenetsia-ekologiuur-problemebze/101146> and http://www.tv25.ge/?page=news&news_id=17487#.VeWZMsVghc see: <http://www.bs-hotspots.eu/EventsGallery>. Information about the training and interviews with project partners were transmitted on 5th and 6th of August by the Ajara TV and the TV company TV25.

Wednesday, August 5th, 2015

The morning session (09.30AM -14.00PM) consisted of presentations and discussions related to the use of the Hot Spot methodology and HSs database. Practical examples of identification and

prioritization of HSs were given, case studies conducted in Ukraine were presented as well as results of the update of the List of HSs in Ukraine.

The following presentations were made:

- Hot Spots methodology: general information. Katerina Utkina;
- Environmental and integrated criteria for HSs ranking. Volodymyr Kresin;
- Regional approach for HSs ranking. Social-economic criteria for HSs ranking. Natalia Iakovleva;
- Mathematical methods for HSs ranking. Volodymyr Brook;
- Hot Spots regional Data Base and requirements for data input. Violeta Velikova.

Katerina Utkina gave general information on the Hot Spots methodology and history of its development, as well as on the way to use the methodology. Volodymyr Kresin explained in detail the integrated criteria for Hot Spots identification and prioritization. Natalia Iakovleva presented social and economical criteria of classification: population and investment attractiveness of the region. Volodymyr Brook described the Mathematical methods and HSs ranking (by SKYPE) applied in the Methodology. Violeta Velikova demonstrated the HS Data base online, explaining also what data are collected in it and how the data input should take place.

The afternoon session (15.00 PM – 18.00 PM) consisted of presentations of Georgian stakeholders related to the following aspects:

- Current Black Sea coastal zone major sources of pollution in Georgia, Nino Chkhobadze;
- Environmental status of the Georgian Black Sea coastal zone in 2010-2014. Irina Baramidze;
- Main sources of surface water pollution in Paliastomi-Poti district and monitoring in 2007-2014. Gia Rukhadze;

Thus, the ‘training’ was interactive, giving the floor to stakeholders, listening to their opinion on major environmental problems in Georgia.

Nino Chkhobadze from the Georgian Greens Movement overviewed major sources of pollution in the Georgian coastal zone - landfills, waste waters from industry and settlements, and agriculture. She underlined that there are no treatment plants for waste waters and many unregistered hot spots are located in the western part of Georgia from where major rivers flow to the Black Sea. This presentation was followed by extensive discussions among the participants and during these discussions the importance of the HS methodology became clear to the GE stakeholders. However, the lack of data on GE HSs would be a problem, thus, first monitoring in GE should improve. So far, the monitoring remains poor and seriously underfunded.

Irina Baramidze presented the Black Sea monitoring data of 2010-2014, which was collected by the Batumi Fisheries and Black Sea Monitoring Center of NEA Georgia. Questions were asked about the measured substances and water quality standards. Availability of data to feed the HSs Data base was also discussed.

Gia Rukhadze, the head of the Research laboratory in Poti, described the particularities of the laboratory, recent works and indicated that the laboratory received accreditation and currently works under ISO standards. However, there is no stable governmental funding, which would allow to involve the Poti Laboratory in routine monitoring of HSs, no matter the need is obvious.

Questions and discussions continued. The main discussed questions were related to the data required for identification and prioritization of hot spots when using the Hot Spots methodology – the GE stakeholders helped to improve the description of data for oxygen, transparency, etc. Also which integrated criteria would be applicable for Georgia having in mind the current availability of data was discussed, and final decision on the online version of the Methodology was taken (Note: The online version will be slightly simplified in comparison with the paper Methodology, where ‘forward-looking’ components will be present – in other words, if the monitoring improves, how the Methodology will also better work. All stakeholders reconfirmed the needs on harmonization, presented by the HBS Project in the major reports – LBS management and monitoring, and Rivers monitoring.

The first day of the training finished at 18.00 PM and was followed by official dinner for the project partners and Georgian stakeholders.

Thursday, August 6th, 2015

The morning session (10.00AM -13.00PM) consisted of presentations of stakeholders and discussions related to the following aspects:

- Assessment of the river Rioni at the confluence of the Black Sea. Manana Juruli
- Biomonitoring of the Black Sea Eutrophication along the coast of Georgia. Manana Devidze
- Emerald network species and habitats along the Kolkheti coastline. Izolda Matchutadze

All presentations of stakeholders were included in the training with the purpose to verify the project findings and to initiate discussions on subjects of interest in the field of integrated HSs management, to undertake further consultations and to improve the products of the HBS Project.

Manana Juruli presented paper about hazardous chemical substances, entering Rioni River mainly during Arsenic mining in Georgia. Mrs Juruli underlined that there is no sufficient monitoring of the River Rioni, however, Irina Baramidze did not completely agree with her and insisted that river monitoring is quite regular for selected parameters. Recent progress is in place as NEA and the Black Sea monitoring center strengthened monitoring of surface waters under various projects. Questions were posted and discussion took place regarding the system of classification of chemicals. Georgia is at the stage of joining the Global Harmonizing System of Classification and Labelling of Chemicals (GHS) created by UN (http://www.unece.org/fileadmin/DAM/trans/danger/publi/ghs/ghs_rev05/English/ST-SG-AC10-30-Rev5e.pdf). She said that Ministry of Environment and Natural Resources of Georgia, Ministry of Labor, Health and Social Affairs of Georgia and Ministry of Economy and Sustainable Development of Georgia are in the stage of preparation of technical regulations and implementation of GHS in Georgia and future monitoring will be held in agreement with the requirements of this system. However, the new GE Law on Water, which is on the level of Parliamentary observation, does not mention GHS. The Georgian stakeholders agreed that major water quality parameters are not measured in river waters, such as trace metals, as well as hydrobiological and bacteriological tests are not conducted as part of the national monitoring system. The head of the Research Laboratory of Poti Municipality Dr. Gia Rukhadze again mentioned that the reasons of insufficient monitoring of surface waters in Georgia are the lack of

finances and capacity building trainings. Stakeholders of the Batumi Fisheries and the Black Sea Monitoring center also face the problem of insufficient and unstable funding, while human resources and qualification are to them of a less burden.

Dr. Manana Devidze presented eutrophication-related problems of Paliastomi-Poti region and reminded that eutrophicated water bodies must be considered as unregistered hot spots in Georgia. Dr. Izolda Machitadze presented review of the biodiversity of Kolkheti Lowland and emerald network species and habitats in the coastline. She discussed the negative impacts of present Hot Spots on the unique biodiversity of the Kolkheti ecosystem.

The last activity of the training was a working meeting of the project partners. Dates of next meetings and other working questions were discussed at this.

The meeting concluded on Thursday at 13.00 PM (the meeting agenda is enclosed as Annex 1).

After lunch (14 PM -18 PM) the social programme included thematic excursions in the Batumi Fish Aquarium and Delphinarium, and in the Batumi Dendrological Garden. In the Dendrological Garden its history, plants biodiversity and particularities of the local coastal ecosystem were presented by a qualified Guide. The Thematic Excursions finished at 18.00 PM.

Annex 1.

AGENDA

Second training in use of Hot Spots methodology and Hot Spots Data Base of the Project

Integrated hotspots management and saving the living Black Sea ecosystem – HOT BLACK SEA 2.2.1.72761.225 MIS-ETC 2303

Date: 4 – 7 August 2015, Batumi, Georgia

Day 1 – 4 August

Arrival and accommodation

19.00 meeting in hall hotel, free conversation, dinner, visit Batumi centre and boulevard

Day 2 – 5 August

Venue: Hotel «Radisson Blue Hotel, Batumi »

Batumi City, Georgia

Morning Session: 09.30 – 14.00

09.30 – 10.00 Registration

10.00 – 10.15 Welcome speech

10.15 – 10.50 Hot Spots methodology: general information. Kateryna Utkina

- 11.50 – 11.25 Environmental and integrated criteria for HSs ranking. Volodymyr Kresin
11.25 – 11.50 Coffee break
11.50 – 12.20 Regional approach for HSs ranking. Social-economic criteria for HSs ranking.
Nataliia Iakovleva
12.20– 12.45 Mathematical methods for HSs ranking. Volodymyr Brook
12.45 – 13.30 Hot Spots regional Data Base and requirements for data input. Violeta Velikova
13.30 – 14.00 Questions and discussions

14.00 – 15.00 Lunch

- Afternoon Session: 15.00 – 18.00

- 15.00 – 15.30 Current Black Sea coastal zone major sources of pollution. Nino Chkhobadze;
15.30 – 16.10 Environmental condition of the Georgian Black Sea coastal zone in 2010-2014.
Irina Baramidze;
16.10 – 16.40 coffee break
16.40 – 17.10 Main sources of surface water pollution in Paliastomi-Poti district and
monitoring in 2007-2014. Gia Rukhadze;
17.10 – 18.00 Questions and discussion

Reception : 19.00 - 22.00

Venue: Hotel «Radisson Blue Hotel, Batumi »

Batumi city, Georgia

Day 3 – 6 August

Morning Session: 10.00 – 13.00

- 10.00 – 10.30 Assessment of the River Rioni at the confluence of the Black Sea. Manana
Juruli
10.30 – 11.00 Biomonitoring of the Black Sea Eutrophication along the coast of Georgia.
Manana Devidze;
11.00 – 11.30 Coffee break
11.30 – 12.00 Emerald network species and habitats along the Kolkheti coastline.
Izolda Matchutadze;
12.00 – 12.30 Working meeting for project partners
12.30 – 12.45 Dates of next meetings and other working questions

12.45 – 14.00 Lunch

14.00 – 18.00: Site visit Batumi Fish Aquarium, Delphinarium and Dendrological Garden

19.00 - 22.00 Dinner

Day 4 – 7 August

Departure

Annex 2.1, 2.2, 2.3 Scanned List of participant with signs (in separate).

Annex 3. Photos.









Project funded by the
EUROPEAN UNION

